

# Classical Music Industry Conference

**#CMIC19**

A two-day conference at Wigmore Hall and  
Middlesex University, in partnership  
with PRS for Music



**Middlesex  
University  
London**



**WIGMORE HALL**



# Schedule

## Day 1 (Tuesday) – Wigmore Hall, London

**13.30 Registration** – Bechstein Room

**14.00 Welcome** – Chris Dromey and Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University)

**14.10** John Gilhooly (Wigmore Hall), 'There is No Single Model, No Assured Formula for Success in Classical Music Administration'

**14.45 Session 1** – *The Future*, chaired by Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University)

Scott Caizley (King's College London), 'The Conservatoire Crisis'

James Murphy (Royal Philharmonic Society), 'The National Conversation on Classical Music'

**15.45 Tea/coffee**

**16.15 Session 2** – *Engagement*, chaired by Brian Inglis (Middlesex University)

Joe Attard (King's College London), 'Opera Virgins at the Movies: Audience Research and Opera Cinema'

Christina McMaster (pianist and Warner Classics), 'Experiential Listening: Responding to Demands of Contemporary Cultures'

Sarah Price and Stephanie Pitts (University of Sheffield), '"£20 to sit in a hall and not actually see anything": Understanding Classical Music Within the Wider Arts Experience'

To be followed by a **Reception (ca. 18.00)**, including a celebration of the publication of *Kaikhosru Sorabji's Letters to Philip Heseltine (Peter Warlock)*, ed. Brian Inglis and Barry Smith (Routledge, 2019).

**19.30 Concert** – NB. tickets not included in conference price;  
Christian Tetzlaff (vln) and Lars Vogt (pf)

## Day 2 (Wednesday) – Middlesex University, Hendon, London

**9.30 Registration, incl. tea/coffee/pastries** – Hendon Town Hall, The Burroughs

**10.15 Welcome** – Chris Dromey and Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University)

**10.30 Parallel Session 3a** – Committee Room 1

*Mediation*, chaired by Neil Smith (Maastricht University)

Tony Stoller (Bournemouth University), 'How the Medium Made the Music: Classical Music and Radio'

Natasha Loges (Royal College of Music, London), 'Programming a Song Recital: Between Pragmatism and Artistry'

Chris Dromey and Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University), 'Rethinking Communication in the Concert Hall'

**Parallel Session 3b** – Committee Room 2

*Opera*, chaired by Sarah Price (University of Sheffield)

Nicholas Boyd-Vaughan (National Opera Studio), 'National Opera Studio's *Diverse Voices* Programme: Supporting and Enabling Diversity in UK Opera'

Charlotte Armstrong (University of York), 'Contemporary Opera Production and the Performance of Disability'

Elaine Kidd (Royal Opera House), 'What is Talent in Opera Today?'

**12.00 Lunch** – Grove mezzanine

**13.00 Parallel Session 4a** – Committee Room 1

*Past and Present*, chaired by Stewart Campbell (University of Birmingham)

Chris Lloyd (pianist and 1781 Collective), 'The Classical Music Recording Industry: Doomed since 1967?'

David Cotter (University of Cambridge), 'Virtual Reality and the Classical Music Industry'

Ellie Moore (Help Musicians UK) and Jane Williams (Middlesex University and London Symphony Orchestra), 'Funding the Future of Classical Music Careers'

**Parallel Session 4b** – Committee Room 2

*Accessibility and Inclusion*, chaired by Peter Fribbins (Middlesex University and London Chamber Music Society)

Kristina J. Kolbe (London School of Economics), 'Performing Interculture: Inequality, Difference, and Diversity in Contemporary Music Production in Berlin'

Gregory Moor (Leeds University), 'Accessibility and Outreach for Arts Organisations'

Michael Haas (exil.arte Centre, University for Music and Performing Arts, Vienna), 'Recovery and Restitution: Vienna's exil.arte Centre'

**14.30 Tea/coffee**

**14.50 Session 5: Roundtable (followed by ca. 16.20 reception/drinks)** – Committee Room 1

'Empirical Approaches to Understanding Inequality and Diversity in Classical Music' – Joseph Browning (University of Oxford), Anna Bull (University of Portsmouth), Christabel Stirling (University of Westminster), Christina Scharff (King's College London); Respondent: Ali Meghji (University of Cambridge)

## **Session 1 – *The Future***

Chaired by Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University)

### **Scott Caizley (King's College London), 'The Conservatoire Crisis'**

Widening participation amongst state-schooled and British and Minority Ethnic (BME) students in UK conservatoires throughout the past years has persisted to remain at an all-time low despite major efforts to increase access for those from underrepresented backgrounds. In the academic year of 2017/18, two of the UK's leading music conservatoires recruited fewer state school students than Oxbridge. While conservatories face further public stigmatisation and heavy financial penalties for failing to meet government benchmarks, there appears to be a more costly outcome to this crisis. This, of course, is the lack of sociocultural diversity which is perpetuated both within the conservatoire sector and the classical music industry at large.

This research investigates the lived experiences of former state-schooled and BME students who are all studying a classical music performance degree in a UK conservatoire. Given the participants' underrepresented status, the research seeks to answer whether or not the students are fitting in or standing out within the conservatoire environment. Illuminating the underrepresented voices within these elite spaces will aid future research and policy, helping tackle the diversity dilemma and giving classical music the social and cultural renewal it so desperately needs.

### **James Murphy (Royal Philharmonic Society), 'The National Conversation on Classical Music'**

Who defines how the nation perceives classical music? How do we refresh that perception for the better? Two hundred years ago, an intrepid group of musicians set out to change the national conversation about classical music. They wanted their art to be better recognised, so they established the Philharmonic Society, introducing a culture of regular concerts to foster greater curiosity and engagement around classical music. This talk explores how, all these years later, the same organisation is asking anew how we can engage hearts and minds nationally with our remarkable musical heritage – and to get people talking about it while embracing its worth like never before.

## **Session 2 – Engagement**

Chaired by Brian Inglis (Middlesex University)

### **Joe Attard (King's College London), 'Opera Virgins at the Movies: Audience Research and Opera Cinema'**

In 2006, Julie Taymor's *Magic Flute* was beamed from New York's Metropolitan Opera House to cinema and TV screens around the world. Simulcasts have since become a multi-million-dollar entertainment industry; many more people now experience live opera on-screen than up close. "Opera cinema" is/was driven by cinema digitalisation and opera companies' outreach agendas, factors closely related to opera's existential need to justify continued state support and to engage new audiences. How successful opera cinema is in this regard, and whether it constitutes a new, hybrid art-form (or merely a mode of transmission for stage opera), remain open questions that this talk will explore.

I make the case that a medium's ontology is defined by: its formal characteristics, the way it is perceived in a broader cultural conversation, and the experience it facilitates. In this context, I report on the findings of a unique project, introducing "opera virgins" to the art form in both the opera house itself and the cinema, and analysing their subjective engagement using Q-methodology and focus-group interviews. Combining this approach with historiographical analysis, I examine the ontology of opera cinema, assess whether it constitutes a new art form, and consider its appeal to new audiences.

### **Christina McMaster (pianist and Warner Classics), 'Experiential Listening: Responding to Demands of Contemporary Cultures'**

Who is listening? In classical music, we frequently ask who is attending concerts, but who is truly listening? Listening happens not only through hearing but on a number of levels: body, mind, and soul. Engaging on all these levels of listening makes for a powerful experience. Great pianist Claudio Arrau once said: "a good concert is like a religious experience." Classical music, in particular, offers the opportunity to listen for longer and deeper. However, current rituals in classical music do not necessarily support the spiritual enlightenment to which the music often lends itself. Meanwhile, the "wellness" industry has witnessed a meteoric rise, driven by changing values and demographics. This talk explores these trends and my own ventures. Last year, for example, I launched *Lie Down and Listen*, a lying-down concert experience preceded by meditation and restorative yoga and offering varied repertoire such as Byrd, Cornysh, Pärt, Monk, Birtwistle, etc. I reflect on how, in the twenty-first-century life, the relationship between music, body, soul and digital technology might be rethought artistically, while also welcoming new audiences to classical music.

**Sarah Price and Stephanie Pitts (University of Sheffield), “£20 to sit in a hall and not actually see anything”: Understanding Classical Music Within the Wider Arts Experience’**

The value of classical music to its devoted audiences is by this point well-rehearsed, as are the so-called ‘barriers’ faced by non-attenders. For a small proportion of the British public, classical music continues to be a source of high emotional impact, providing moments of peace, escapism and elation in the modern world. For many, however, classical music is viewed as an elitist and exclusive art form, its concert etiquette designed to trip up and expose newcomers. While research at either extreme of engagement continues to grow, there has been comparatively little investigation into the way in which audiences dip into classical music as part of a varied arts ‘diet’. Evidence shows that most concert attenders go at most once a year (Bradshaw, 2017), and therefore understanding how a multitude of art forms are navigated and experienced by contemporary audiences is a priority.

In this paper, we share findings on classical music from our large qualitative study, *Understanding Audiences for the Contemporary Arts*. We draw on in-depth interviews with 187 arts attenders from four UK cities to understand the place (or absence) of classical music in their arts engagement. We share the ways in which classical and contemporary music can be cherished as part of varied arts engagement, as well as highlighting the factors that can still put off some of the most passionate arts audiences. We consider how viewing concert attenders not as ‘owned’ by an organisation but as varied and empowered arts consumers might shed light on new avenues for presenting classical music that appeals to a wider audience.

## **Parallel Session 3a – Mediation**

Chaired by Neil Smith (Maastricht University)

### **Tony Stoller (Bournemouth University), 'How the Medium Made the Music: Classical Music and Radio'**

Ever since time Dame Nellie Melba first broadcast on the Marconi Company's new Chelmsford radio station on 15 June 1920, there has been the closest relationship between classical music and sound broadcasting. Classical music was an essential staple of the BBC in its earlier years, when popular music was at best tolerated as a necessary evil, and remained an important part of the output even when popular music became more dominant. The launch of the Third Programme on 26 September 1946, offering highbrow classical music alongside other cultural output, reinforced this relationship, which was expressed through the entire range of the BBC's national radio services. From 1973 onwards, the commercial competitors breaking the BBC's local radio monopoly offered a surprising range of classical music output, and from 7 September 1992 the dominant presence of Classic FM on the UK airwaves ensured a dynamic and competitive place for this genre of music in the evolving media platforms at the end of the 20th century and into the 21st.

This paper will sketch the history of classical music on UK radio. It will examine the place of recorded music, which grew from a largely under-valued part of the BBC's output to become the central staple of the BBC and commercial radio. It will consider the broadcaster as patron, supporter and developer of classical music, and the role which broadcasting institutions have played in developing new music and supporting contemporary musicians. It will examine the growth of mass audiences for classical music on UK radio, and how they have been sustained into the present, despite the huge changes being brought about by the growth of internet platforms and digital music provision. With reference also to the situation in Europe and the United States, this paper will argue that radio has been central to maintaining the presence and profile of classical music in western society; that the survival of the genre as a mass-consumed cultural product has been largely dependent on its radio presence and salience; and will consider whether this symbiosis will continue to apply in the digital-dominated years ahead.

### **Natasha Loges (Royal College of Music, London), 'Programming a Song Recital: Between Pragmatism and Artistry'**

Despite offering a uniquely accessible repertoire, song recitals are notorious for their financial unviability. Excepting venues like the Wigmore Hall, which nurtures a uniquely loyal audience, most festivals and venues shy away from the risk of song recitals. This paper presents a research project which explored how internationally successful recital singers and collaborative pianists programme their recitals. All Wigmore Hall regulars, they explain how they balance perceived pre-existing audience and venue demands with the artistic integrity associated with this relatively non-commercial concert format. Their observations are first contextualised against 19th-century approaches to recital programming, in which financial pressures were no less severe, but variety was paramount. They are then reinterpreted against the backdrop of modern practices, drawing on four reflections:

- The role of mainstream concert programming, which is built around a core of large-scale canonical works, such as symphonies, concertos or string quartets.
- The role of recording, which both potentially limited and expanded the song repertoire, but most importantly, established an enduring hegemony of 'correct' programming practices replicated on stage, on recordings and in broadcasting.
- The role of musicology, which has promulgated similarly 'completist' approaches to repertoire.
- The role of *doing* rather than just listening, i.e. the link between one's own musicianship and recital attendance.

The paper closes with a discussion of a concert event hosted by Wigmore Hall which combined current and historical approaches to song recital programming, arguing that the structural challenges may be less rigid than they seem.

### **Chris Dromey and Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University), 'Rethinking Communication in the Concert Hall'**

How classical music is mediated in the concert hall has been a shared research interest of ours over the last couple of years. Building on previous studies into classical music broadcasting and non-traditional concert-giving (Dromey/Haferkorn, 2018), this joint paper will chronicle, contextualise and critique some of these practices, principally from the perspective of programme notes (including digital notes and graphical listening guides) and of oral communication by conductors and/or musicians from the orchestral concert stage. Such novelties largely remain just that, being introduced sporadically in the name of accessibility (and, ergo, of commerce) and generally eschewing long-form prose altogether. While other studies have shown a general correlation between a lack of lexical understanding and dissatisfaction among first-time classical concertgoers (Dearn/Pitts, 2017), or that planned mediation can actually reduce musical enjoyment (Hellmuth Margulis, 2010), there is no silver bullet for concert administrators (or musicologists) to find in existing research, nor a framework to help understand the effects of innovative mediation on audience enjoyment and understanding. Drawing on a sequence of interviews conducted by both presenters, we will therefore examine what organisations hope to achieve as they rethink their in-concert communication strategies, and how such endeavours have been received. In so doing, we will also draw on recent debates advocating a more public-oriented musicology, examine salient flashpoints in the classical music industry, and consider the possible futures of musical subjectivity and multivalency in these contexts.

## **Parallel Session 3b – Opera**

Chaired by Sarah Price (University of Sheffield)

### **Nicholas Boyd-Vaughan (National Opera Studio), ‘National Opera Studio’s *Diverse Voices* Programme: Supporting and Enabling Diversity in UK Opera’**

In 2016, the National Opera Studio, with the support of Arts Council England and Help Musicians UK, commissioned a report by Graham Devlin CBE, to look at the current landscape of opera training for singers in the UK, and how this should evolve to meet the changing needs of the profession. This comprehensive report concluded with several recommendations, including, as a priority, the necessity to make opera more diverse and accessible. The National Opera Studio had previously run a programme which aimed to support singers from BAME backgrounds. The decision was made that this programme should be reactivated, that its reach should be increased and that its mandate should be widened to address some of the barriers to the profession identified by the report. From this the *Diverse Voices* programme was created, which is working across the opera sector to facilitate and ensure tangible action in identifying, supporting, sign-posting, providing for, and mentoring BAME singers who have the potential to pursue a career in opera. This presentation will introduce the next phase of the *Diverse Voices* programme and *Living Opera*, a series of articles, written by established singers who have had to overcome barriers or challenges in their careers.

### **Charlotte Armstrong (University of York), ‘Contemporary Opera Production and the Performance of Disability’**

From deadly diseases and debilitating wounds, visual impairments and deafness, to physical impairments such as lost limbs and spinal deformities, to cognitive and mental disorders – the opera stage has always been a platform for the representation of disability. Despite recent strides towards the incorporation of disability studies frameworks into musicology, representations of disability in opera have been afforded very little critical attention. Yet, the combined perspectives of both disability and opera studies sheds light on the sustained and often-problematic use of disability in the narratives of canonical operas. The additional insights offered by theatre and performance studies emphasise the ways in which the interpretation and representation of disabled characters in contemporary opera productions often reinforces stock character tropes and shores up damaging disability stereotypes.

With reference to several recent productions of Franz Schreker’s *Die Gezeichneten* and Alexander Zemlinsky’s *Der Zwerg*, this paper outlines the problematic practice of disability mimicry in contemporary opera production and seeks to address questions about the performance of disability on opera stages today. Many disability studies and performance scholars oppose the appropriation of the lived experience of disability and the often-derogatory mimicry of physical impairment by non-disabled performers, whilst others cite the associated overlooking of disabled performers in casting procedures for theatre and film. However, each solution to these various ‘problems’ of disability in live performance seems to present a unique set of challenges. This paper begins to unpick some of these questions by

asking what if anything, we can do to address negative disability representation on contemporary opera stages.

### **Elaine Kidd (Royal Opera House), 'What is Talent in Opera Today?'**

What do current seismic shifts in the social and political landscape mean for the traditionally slow-moving beast that is opera? Training is by necessity long for careers of longevity. Gatekeepers are specialists; many remain in post over decades. The established audience for opera is niche, the pull on their finances and on the public purse significant, at a time when new forms of art and entertainment actively – and increasingly successfully – vie for attention and funds. What does this mean for those with operatic talent today? What kind of career are they honing their skills for and what are those skills? And are those in training the right ones to take on the future of the artform?

## **Parallel Session 4a – *Past and Present***

Chaired by Stewart Campbell (University of Birmingham)

### **Chris Lloyd (pianist and 1781 Collective), 'The Classical Music Recording Industry: Doomed since 1967?'**

In the late 1960s, Glenn Gould wrote a range of texts detailing his excitement at the prospects new recording technology offered to classical music. The essence of his philosophy was that the concert was dead, and that recording technology offered a chance for musicians to create something far greater than could be achieved onstage. How we misunderstood him. The industry in Britain, led by EMI's Walter Legge, did indeed pursue exactly this: through the modification of performance through editing techniques that allowed inhuman perfection. The slow filtering effect of this revolution has now eventuated in performing musicians being petrified by the perception of being held hostage by audience members referred to by Alfred Brendel as "wrong-note fiends".

Gould (and later, John Culshaw), however, was advocating not for the omission of human flaws, but the creation of completely new artworks through the medium. Fanciful and ridiculous? Just ask the pop industry: two years after Gould made these claims, The Beatles released *Sgt Pepper's Lonely Hearts Club Band*, an album that existed purely on record and never intended for performance. Meanwhile, classical recordings have been stuck on the carousel of Edison's 'Tone Tests' for over a century, purporting to merely reproduce the "best seat in the house" effect. Where recorded music once tried to emulate live experience, roles have been reversed. The result: that musicians prioritise impossible levels of perfection above all else – including expression and individual musicality.

### **David Cotter (University of Cambridge), 'Virtual Reality and the Classical Music Industry'**

This paper explores the collaborative work *BREKEKEKEX* (2019), and how virtual reality and other contemporary innovations are shaping the classical music industry. *BREKEKEKEX* explores the interface between physical and virtual realities in the context of classical music performance; principally through a semi-structured improvisational approach using instructional and notated material displayed in 3D space, using an Oculus Rift head-mounted display. This method presents new challenges and possibilities for classical music performance, developing Berkowitz's "principles of virtual space-as-form" and exploring virtual environments as dynamic platforms for music-making.

February's premiere of *BREKEKEKEX* at the EXPO2 Festival shone light on many of the unique affordances which virtual reality can bring to the classical music industry. While fragments of material appear and disappear in a panoramic field around the performer, forcing embodied decision-making and emphasising gestural content, the audience are consequently "invisible" to the performer, enabling heightened expressivity in performance. The technologies used in a performance of the piece, such as the Constellation tracking system in the Oculus Rift headset (which transforms real-time positioning data into an ambient soundscape over which the performer improvises, alongside virtual guitar strings which adorn the performance space)

present fresh challenges for broadcasting contemporary classical music in real time. Previously clearly defined roles—audience, composer, performer—are reassessed. Ultimately, VR offers a literal and metaphorical opportunity for musicians within the western classical tradition to transcend genre boundaries, and to enter ever-evolving contemporary performance contexts.

**Ellie Moore (Help Musicians UK) and Jane Williams (Middlesex University and London Symphony Orchestra), 'Funding the Future of Classical Music Careers'**

Help Musicians is an independent charity with an extraordinary history: for nearly a century it has provided a broad spectrum of help, support and opportunities to empower musicians, at all stages of their careers. Providing vital financial support for classical musicians training at the highest level has been part of the charity's work since 1921. Help Musicians is committed to exploring the future training needs of the classical music sector, to ensure the charity's initiatives and programmes of support for musicians continue to sustain careers. This talk will be an opportunity to hear more about the work of Help Musicians, how we support emerging classical musicians and our insights into the challenges and opportunities experienced by these musicians through our work. The session will discuss the aims of a new research project recently commissioned by the charity entitled *The Future of Classical Music Careers*, led by culture professionals Susanna Eastburn and Jane Williams. This research aims to understand the future landscape of classical music, the career prospects for those entering the profession in the next decade, and what training and support is needed to achieve sustainable and fulfilling careers.

## **Parallel Session 4b – Accessibility and Inclusion**

Chaired by Peter Fribbins (Middlesex University and London Chamber Music Society)

### **Kristina J. Kolbe (London School of Economics), 'Performing Interculture: Inequality, Difference, and Diversity in Contemporary Music Production in Berlin'**

My presentation explores contemporary forms of music production and performance in Berlin and analyses to what extent these are associated with transformative forms of urban multiculturalism, or the reproduction of elite formations and racialised notions of difference. Based on an ethnographic study, including interviewing, participant observations and musicological reflections, I examine a self-described 'intercultural' opera project taking place in Berlin. The project interrogates its position as part of Germany's highbrow music realm by promoting a 'Turkish German' intervention in Berlin's cultural sector. Set against the project's specific institutional setting and its urban context, where the legacies of German imperialism and racialised guestworker policies continue to crystallise, I probe how the project's organisational and aesthetic practices construct particular notions of difference and shape concepts of cultural value and legitimacy – in short, I examine how interculturalism is performed in the context of the project.

In so doing, I consider the creative practices of music-making but also link such aesthetic discussions to an analysis of wider discourses around citizenship, identity and belonging that operate in Germany. My study traces to what extent the project unsettles hegemonic constructions of difference but also shows when and under which conditions the project reproduces marginalising discourses around 'race', migration, class and gender by ultimately relegating transgressive musical representations back into the standardised logics of a Western art music institution. This study contributes to critical scholarship on cultural production concerned with the remaking of social inequalities and cultural distinctions in the context of urban multiculturalism.

### **Gregory Moor (Leeds University), 'Accessibility and Outreach for Arts Organisations'**

This study investigates ways that technology can make the physical space of arts venues more accessible and increase engagement for neurodiverse audiences. Accessibility can be viewed as a form of outreach but, to date, this approach has been under-utilised in research on arts organisations. Therefore, literature from other practices will be explored to understand how organisations value outreach and how accessibility can enhance them, including the use of technology to alleviate issues faced by neurodivergent individuals: Theimer (*Outreach*, 2014) explores the concept of outreach; Smith and Pangsapa (*Environment and Citizenship: Integrating Justice, Responsibility and Civic Engagement*, 2008) consider social sustainability for business.

This paper presents the findings of a study that interviewed arts organisations, funders, technology leaders and user-groups to comprehend the value of investing in technology for arts organisations. Findings indicate that accessibility requires interested organisers who understand the diversity of needs to prevent a feeling of "otherness." Furthermore, the use of technologically-enabled images of arts spaces can help to mitigate nervousness towards the unknown among neurodiverse audiences. Finally, success in accessibility is achieved with

involvement from the target community, and technological solutions can be successful if user-group input is considered. As such, flexibility in these technology provisions can also reflect and complement the diversity of needs.

**Michael Haas (exil.arte Centre, University for Music and Performing Arts, Vienna),  
'Recovery and Restitution: Vienna's exil.arte Centre'**

In May 2017, Vienna's University of Music and Performing Arts opened its exil.arte Centre, the first centre for the recovery, restoration, archiving and dissemination of music lost in the political upheavals of the twentieth century. It is based in the historic building of Vienna's Music Academy next to the Konzerthaus, thereby occupying the building where Franz Schreker and Erich Korngold taught and many important composers and performers studied. The centre opened with two musical estates: Hans Gál and Julius Bürger. Since opening, it has acquired the musical estates of many more composers, conductors and performers, ranging from Erwin Piscator and Wilhelm Grosz, to Jan Kiepura and Georg Tintner. The estates it has since acquired have already resulted in new impulses in programming and recordings, along with new initiatives in teaching and outreach. As this paper explains, the exil.arte Centre cannot offer new solutions to the problems of funding, but can offer a new and welcome source of audience-friendly repertoire that has grown organically out of the past, and which provides a bridge between Late Romanticism and Early Modernity.

## Session 5 – Roundtable

### *Empirical Approaches to Understanding Inequality and Diversity in Classical Music*

Joseph Browning (University of Oxford)

Anna Bull (University of Portsmouth)

Ali Meghji (University of Cambridge) [Respondent]

Christina Scharff (King's College London)

Christabel Stirling (University of Westminster)

Despite its consistently high levels of public funding, classical music in the UK remains largely the practice and province of the white middle classes. More often treated as a text than a cultural practice, empirical studies of classical music's institutions, traditions, modes of production, performance, and reception are crucial to understanding and transforming inequality and diversity within the genre. In the UK, discourse around diversity and equality in classical music has been gaining increased traction, paralleled by the emergence of new initiatives and ensembles. High-profile examples include the PRS Keychange campaign, which encourages music organisations to achieve a 50:50 gender balance by 2022; the In Harmony Sistema England programmes, which provide classical music tuition to disadvantaged communities; Resound, the first disabled-led ensemble in the world; and the Chineke orchestra, the first majority black and minority ethnic professional orchestra in Europe. At the same time, the politicisation of 'diversity' and 'inclusivity' poses challenges for how we can think and act meaningfully about such issues without recourse to reductive or polarising viewpoints.

Responding to these debates, this panel draws on recent empirical studies to explore issues of inequality and diversity in classical music. Key questions include: how do those working within the classical music industry talk about and understand diversity? How do the institutions of classical music reproduce inequalities? To what extent is the music itself, its aesthetic and practices, implicated in the reproduction of inequalities? Are its inequalities still 'unspeakable' or are we seeing a shift to a more progressive, open discourse in this area? How are varied ideas about transformation and change put into practice? And how are these ideas received, and potentially acted upon, by audiences?

This panel will feature short position papers from researchers who have conducted anthropological and sociological work on classical and contemporary classical music in settings related to education, musicians, festivals, and audiences. Following the four short papers outlined below, the respondent, Ali Meghji, will discuss points raised in the papers from the perspective of critical race theory, drawing on his work on Black middle-class people in London consuming 'white cultural capital', including classical music.

Given that the debate on inequality in classical music is still at an early stage, we see this an opportunity to make visible the conversations and assumptions circulating in this area and to interrogate what is meant by the terms of the debate, exploring what progress should or could look like. Drawing on Saha (2018) we ask whether we need to move beyond a focus on measuring diversity through quantitative representation and to focus instead on *how* and

what is being produced—an approach that requires qualitative empirical research to supplement survey-based, industry and government-led data collection.

The first speaker, Anna Bull outlines the arguments from her recent book, *Class, Control, and Classical Music* (OUP, 2019), an ethnographic study of young people playing in classical music groups in England, to examine class, gender and whiteness in classical music practice. She argues that inequalities in classical music production need to be understood through examining the classed, gendered and racialised practices that are used to create its distinctive aesthetic. This very aesthetic, requiring a long-term investment of time, effort, and expert teaching, retains classical music as a middle-class space and practice. However, the boundary-drawing work that the aesthetic does is camouflaged by discourses of classical music being a universal language that is autonomous from the social.

The second speaker, Christina Scharff, analyses how female, early-career musicians talk about inequalities in the classical music industry in 2019. Based on eighteen qualitative in-depth interviews, and set against the backdrop of critical, scholarly debates on the current 'luminosity' of feminism, the presentation demonstrates that cultural workers are aware of, and willing to talk about gendered, racialised and classed hierarchies at work. Compared with earlier accounts of the 'unspeakability' of inequalities, especially in the cultural and creative industries, the research participants' incisive discussion of inequalities marks a shift. At the same time, the presentation shows that the research participants' accounts are suffused with individualist and neoliberal rhetoric, thus pointing to continuities in cultural workers' sense-making.

The third speaker, Christabel Stirling, draws on multi-sited ethnographic audience research conducted in London to explore how racial and class boundaries are inadvertently recreated in classical and new music. Focusing on attempts by new music initiatives to draw new and broader audiences, she examines the ambiguity that abounds around the word 'new', with energies seemingly often directed towards countering the ageing of classical music audiences, rather than addressing deeper histories of inequality and cultural exclusion relating to race and class. Given these limitations, she explores the extent to which practices of curation, promotion, site-specificity, and performance could become sites for experimenting with more radical forms of social transformation, engaging specifically with the views of those who remain absent from classical music.

The fourth speaker, Joe Browning, explores how inequality and diversity are imagined 'on the ground' within the contemporary classical music scene. Taking as a case study the figuration of diversity in terms of an 'ecosystem' - one of the metaphors circulating in the scene - he considers how such figurations operate, how they intersect with debates over originality, aesthetic pluralism and commercialism, and how we might theorise the relationship between figurations that are variously informal and institutionalised, and oriented by different values and assumptions. With this in mind, he argues that empirical attention to situated projects for equality and diversity, and theorisation of the close (yet understudied) relationship between the academy and the classical music industry, are both crucial to effecting cultural change.

## Biographies

**Charlotte Armstrong** is a doctoral researcher in the Department of Music at the University of York. With her research taking place at the intersection of opera studies, disability studies, and cultural studies, Charlotte's thesis examines the representation of disability and pre-Fascist discourses of 'degeneracy' in the operas of Franz Schreker and Alexander Zemlinsky. She has created and maintains an emerging disability arts website ([www.operaanddisability.com](http://www.operaanddisability.com)) which is dedicated to exploring the representation of disability in opera. In parallel to her life in academia, Charlotte works for the Open Preservation Foundation, a not-for-profit organisation that sustains technology and knowledge for the long-term management of digital cultural heritage.

**Joseph Attard** recently completed his PhD in Film Studies at King's College London, conducted jointly with the Royal Opera House. He has written extensively on the subject, including a chapter in the first compendium of essays on live and event cinema, *Live Cinema: Cultures, Economies, Aesthetics* (2016). He has also written for *Opera Quarterly*, co-editing a special issue in 2018 centred on opera cinema, and co-organised the first academic conference on the topic at KCL in 2017. His general interests revolve around the intersection between media, technology, audience experience, and political economy.

**Nicholas Boyd-Vaughan** is Head of Communications for the National Opera Studio, directing the Studio's marketing, digital and communications strategies and output. Nicholas started his career as a singer, studying at the Royal College of Music Junior Department and the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama. After a brief performing career, he made the decision to leave the stage and joined the press office of the Royal Opera House, firstly attached to the Learning and Participation team and ROH2, and then to The Royal Opera. In 2011, Nicholas joined the Concerts Team at St Martin-in-the-Fields, where he was responsible for the artistic direction of the Lunchtime Concert Series, the founding of St Martin's Embassy and Cultural Institute Series, the creation of the myStMartin's membership scheme, and the marketing of over 400 concerts each year. In 2018, Nicholas was made a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts, in recognition of his work in cultural diplomacy and expanding the reach of the National Opera Studio into 163 countries. Nicholas is also a Member of the Chartered Institute of Public Relations and the Arts Marketing Association. Away from the Studio, Nicholas is a Director and Trustee of diverse opera company Pegasus Opera, and lectures in Arts Marketing for the MA Arts Management and MA Classical Music Business courses at Middlesex University.

**Joseph Browning** is British Academy Postdoctoral Fellow in the Faculty of Music at the University of Oxford and St Hilda's College, Oxford. His research interests include ethnographic approaches to Western art music and the transnational scene surrounding the Japanese *shakuhachi*. He has articles published or forthcoming in *Ethnomusicology Forum*, the *Journal of Musicology*, *Ethnomusicology*, *JRMA*, and *Twentieth-Century Music*.

**Anna Bull** is Senior Lecturer in the School of Sociology and Education at the University of Portsmouth. Her research interests span class and gender inequalities in classical music education and sexual harassment within higher education. She is a founder and director of The 1752 Group ([www.1752group.com](http://www.1752group.com)), a research and lobby organisation working to address staff sexual

misconduct in higher education. Her monograph *Class, Control, and Classical Music*, looking at cultures of class and gender among young middle-class classical musicians in the south of England, is recently published with Oxford University Press.

**Scott Caizley** is a former classical musician who is now an ESRC-funded PhD researcher at Kings College London. Scott holds a first-class honours degree from UCL and an MPhil degree from the University of Cambridge. His research in widening participation to classical music has received international acclaim and has been published by *Classical Music* (Rhinegold) and the Higher Education Policy Institute (HEPI).

**David Thomas Cotter** is currently reading for his PhD in Music in the Faculty of Music at the University of Cambridge, under the supervision of Prof. John Rink. His thesis (Collaborative Creativity in Classical Guitar Performance: Reassessing the Role of the Accompanist) comprises researching the performance practice of classical guitar accompaniment from 1800 to the present day, compiling a database of published repertoire, identifying how the instrument's unique affordances and characteristics possess suitability for accompaniment, and exploring how embodied, musical and visual performative devices, both existing and innovative, can convey aesthetic intentions. David completed his MPhil at the University of Cambridge (2017–18) and obtained his BA Music at the University of Durham (2013–16). Recent engagements have included presenting a lecture-recital at the International Guitar Research Centre Conference in Hong Kong, performing Mario Castelnuovo-Tedesco's *Romancero Gitano* with The Choir of Gonville & Caius College, co-organising *The Classical Musician in the 21st Century* conference at the University of Cambridge, and giving the world premiere of the first piece for classical guitar and VR headset at the University of Oxford. David is also Academic Programme Manager for the Brescia Classical Guitar Symposium (Italy), a member of the Ismena Collective, and performs as one half of *Duo Palatino*.

**Chris Dromey** is Associate Professor of Music at Middlesex University, where he has led BA Music Business and Arts Management since 2006. He co-edited *The Classical Music Industry* (Routledge, 2018), wrote *The Pierrot Ensembles: Chronicle and Catalogue, 1912–2012* (Plumbago, 2013), and has contributed chapters and essays to *Stravinsky in Context* (CUP, forthcoming), *Mining the Gap: Musics with and after Tonality* (Routledge, forthcoming), *Music in the Social and Behavioral Sciences* (SAGE, 2014), *British Music and Modernism, 1895–1960* (Ashgate, 2010), *New Makers of Modern Culture* (Routledge, 2007), and *Zemlinsky Studies* (Middlesex UP, 2007). Further research has appeared in *Tempo* (on Grupo Novo Horizonte de São Paulo, 1988–99) and the *International Journal for Contemporary Composition* (on neo-modernism in music). Chris also writes programme notes for Kings Place, London, formerly worked for PRS for Music, and is a Trustee of the Society for Music Analysis.

**John Gilhooly OBE** is Artistic and Executive Director of Wigmore Hall and Chairman of the Royal Philharmonic Society. John became Director of Wigmore Hall in 2005, making him then the youngest leader of any of the world's great concert halls. He has been Executive Director of Wigmore Hall since December 2000 and has overseen the artistic, financial and administrative transformation of the Hall over the past 16 years. His tenure has produced record box office returns and the Hall's highest ever membership levels and annual fundraising. As Artistic Director of Wigmore Hall, he programmes the largest chamber music and song series in the world, and he is noted for his commitment to outstanding emerging artists, diversity and contemporary music. John Gilhooly has been honoured by heads of state and academic institutions. In 2013 he was awarded an OBE by Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II and in 2015 was made a Knight of the Order of the White Rose of Finland by the President of Finland. John has also received the prestigious

Austrian Cross of Honour for Science and Art, and the Order of the Star of Italy (Cavaliere), awarded by the President of Italy. In 2016 he was awarded the German Order of Merit, which is Germany's highest civilian honour. He is a recipient of Honorary Fellowship of the Royal Academy of Music (2006), Honorary Membership of the Royal College of Music (2012), Honorary Fellowship of the Guildhall School (2015), and Honorary Fellowship of the Royal Irish Academy of Music (2016).

**Michael Haas** has, since joining Decca in 1977, become an award-winning recording executive, at various points in his career acting as principal recording producer for Sir Georg Solti and the Chicago Symphony Orchestra and Claudio Abbado and the Berlin Philharmonic. He also served as Vice-President of A&R at Sony Records in New York, before returning to Decca in 1995 where he continued his work with the *Entartete Musik* series, which he began in the mid-1980s with first releases of works by Zemlinsky and Schoenberg. From 2002 to 2010 he was Music Curator at Vienna's Jewish Museum, and in 2013 his book *Forbidden Music – The Jewish Composers Banned by the Nazis* was published by Yale University Press. Following publication of *Forbidden Music*, enquiries followed regarding “orphaned” estates of musicians and performing artists forced to leave Germany and Austria after 1933, resulting in the creation of the *exil.arte* Centre, which he runs with his colleague Prof. Gerold Gruber. Michael's blog and full biography can be found at [www.forbiddenmusic.org](http://www.forbiddenmusic.org).

**Julia Haferkorn** is Senior Lecturer in Music Business and Arts Management and Programme Leader of MA Classical Music Business at Middlesex University as well as Director of Third Ear Music, the production company she co-founded to specialise in contemporary music and arts events. She has worked in the classical music sector for over 20 years, starting at Peters Edition, where she promoted the music of John Cage and Brian Ferneyhough, among others. In 1998, Julia founded the artist agency Haferkorn Associates, which she ran for 18 years. She has worked with such artists as the Arditti Quartet, Apartment House, Icebreaker, Matthew Herbert, Loré Lixenberg, and Ian Pace, setting up concerts and tours across the UK and worldwide. Julia recently co-edited and contributed to *The Classical Music Industry* (Routledge, 2018), having previously carried out the Arts Council England-funded research project *Mapping Contemporary Music Activity in Great Britain* and authored *The Composer's Toolkit* and *The Producer's Toolkit* for Sound and Music. Julia has also served as Co-Artistic Director of the British Composer Awards (2014–16).

**Elaine Kidd** is a director, producer and educator, and currently Head of the Jette Parker Young Artists Programme at the Royal Opera House. She manages the core programme for singers, stage directors and conductors, and leads on initiatives to diversify talent pipelines. She previously worked at ROH as a director and has revived productions as varied as *Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg*, *La Fille du régiment*, *L'Heure espagnole*, and *Lady Macbeth of Mtsensk*. She was Associate Director for *Boris Godunov* and *La bohème*. Elaine studied Modern Languages at Oxford University and trained in movement and devising. She worked as a theatre director before moving into opera. As Head of Staff Directors for The Royal Opera (2007–10), she worked alongside Richard Jones, Laurent Pelly and Graham Vick among others, and revived Royal Opera productions in London and overseas including at La Scala, Milan, the Liceu in Barcelona, New National Theatre Tokyo and Deutsche Oper Berlin. She joined Scottish Opera in 2011 as Director of Artistic Planning, selecting repertoire, creative teams, casting and creating production schedules. She has more than twenty years of experience of fostering young artists in conservatoires, summer schools and training institutions and igniting a passion for opera through countless community and education projects. Elaine's own productions include *La bohème* and *La traviata* (Opera Holland Park), *Così fan tutte* and *Eugene Onegin* (Diva Opera), *Peter Grimes* (Scottish Opera), *La Scala di seta* and *The Rape of Lucretia* (Opera Europe), *Banished*, *Into the Woods* and *Mahagonny Songspiel* (Trinity Laban) and *Docteur Miracle* (Festival Les Azuriales).

**Kristina J. Kolbe** is a Leverhulme Award doctoral student at the Sociology Department at the London School of Economics and Political Science. Supervised by Mike Savage and David Madden, she is furthermore affiliated with the LSE International Inequalities Institute. Holding a MSc from the LSE in Culture and Society and a BA in Musicology, Media Studies and Social Sciences from the Humboldt University Berlin and King's College London, Kristina is especially interested in interdisciplinary approaches to cultural sociology and questions of social inequality, with a particular focus on issues around urban multiculturalism. During her Bachelor and Master studies, she was funded by the German National Merit Foundation. Before re-joining the LSE for her PhD, Kristina completed a fellowship at and worked as a consultant for UNESCO Headquarters in Paris.

**Natasha Loges** is Reader in Musicology at the Royal College of Music. Her interests include concert history, music and literature, and the life and music of Johannes Brahms. She is author of *Brahms and his Poets* (Boydell, 2017) and co-editor of *Musical Salon Culture in the Long Nineteenth Century* (Boydell, 2019), *Brahms in Context* (CUP, 2019), and *Brahms in the Home and the Concert Hall* (CUP, 2014). The book *German Song Onstage*, co-edited with Laura Tunbridge, is forthcoming with Indiana UP. She has contributed to *Music and Literature in German Romanticism*, *The Cambridge Companion to the Singer-Songwriter*, the *Cambridge History of Musical Performance*, and to the journals *Music & Letters*, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, and *19<sup>th</sup>-Century Music*. A pianist, Natasha broadcasts for BBC Radio 3, reviews for *BBC Music Magazine*, and has spoken at festivals and venues such as the Southbank Centre, BBC Proms, Sheffield's Music in the Round, the Oxford Lieder Festival, and Leeds Lieder.

**Chris Lloyd** is a Berlin-based concert pianist, author, curator, and co-founder of the international interdisciplinary movement, Crossmodalism. Lloyd is passionate about radical disruption and change within the traditional classical music industry. Aside from performance, he is currently writing his first book (published by Repeater Books), exploring the existing flaws with the traditional system, and has been published by Interlude (Hong Kong), Classeek Showroom (Switzerland) and Limelight Magazine (Australia). He has given talks on entrepreneurialism and music at the Royal Academy of Music, Also Festival (UK), Festival No. 6 (Wales), and given masterclasses at the University of Cambridge. In 2018 he founded the 1781 Collective, whose mission is to explore new methods of classical music performance, driven by the motto: "Why play along with the system when we can just create our own?"

**Christina McMaster** is a pianist, curator, composer and Artist Relations and Promotions Manager at Warner Classics. She has performed extensively nationally and internationally with broadcasts and live performances on BBC Radio and Classic FM. Christina has worked with a whole host of artists and industries from folk to jazz musicians, rappers, scientists, and fashion designers, and is dedicated to promoting women composers. In 2018 she founded *Lie Down and Listen* – a lying down concert experience preceded by meditation and restorative yoga. See also [www.liedownandlisten.com](http://www.liedownandlisten.com) and [www.christinamcmaster.org](http://www.christinamcmaster.org).

**Ali Meghji** is Lecturer in Social Inequalities, having completed a research fellowship at Sidney Sussex College, a visiting fellowship at Harvard's Weatherhead Centre, and a PhD, MPhil, and BA in Sociology at Cambridge. Ali's predominant research interests lie in critical race theory and decolonial thought. His book *Black Middle-Class Britannia: Identities, Repertoires, Cultural Consumption* is forthcoming with Manchester University Press.

**Gregory Moor** recently completed his MSc Management Consulting at the University of Leeds, a radical change from his BA Music award. Gregory trained as a conductor, though is proficient with a range of instruments. He has also sung with the Clothworkers Consort of Leeds and co-founded a choir, Cantus Ortus, with his wife Esther. Gregory has a rich history within the arts both onstage and backstage. Notably, he has been a part of the National Youth Ballet and stage manager for part of the Leeds International Festival. He lives in Leeds with his wife and two cats.

**Ellie Moore** is Senior Creative Programme Officer at independent music charity Help Musicians UK, where she has worked since 2015, focussing on grant-making research and evaluation projects. Ellie is a passionate advocate for the work of Help Musicians UK, regularly offering funding advice to musicians and speaking on panels for organisations such as Liverpool Sound City, BBC Introducing, and the Association of British Orchestras. Ellie is a graduate of the Liverpool Institute for Performing Arts and holds an MSc in Social Research from Goldsmiths, University of London. Her research there focussed on the impact of smartphones and streaming on music listening behaviours and attitudes.

**James Murphy** has been Chief Executive of the Royal Philharmonic Society since Summer 2018. Previously, he was Managing Director of Southbank Sinfonia, the orchestra that provides graduate musicians with a much-needed springboard into the music profession. Under James's artistic and executive leadership, the orchestra enjoyed a period of noted prosperity and growth. He was responsible for planning and programming over 70 concerts annually, instigating the orchestra's acclaimed role centre-stage in the National Theatre's *Amadeus*. Previously he was Director of Communications of the National Youth Orchestra where he refreshed the brand of a treasured institution, putting the voice of its young members at the forefront and creating ventures nationwide for them to inspire younger children. Prior to this he was Marketing Manager of the Royal College of Music where he co-led the vocational advice department, advising students and alumni on promoting themselves and establishing their careers. James has appeared as a guest commentator on the BBC Proms broadcasts, on BBC 2, BBC 4 and BBC Radio 3, and written about music for Huffington Post. At the outset of his career, he worked with the BBC Philharmonic and for the cellist Julian Lloyd-Webber, and studied Music at the University of York.

**Stephanie Pitts** is Professor in Music at the University of Sheffield, with research interests in musical participation, arts audiences, and lifelong learning. She is the author of books including *Valuing Musical Participation* (Ashgate, 2005), *Chances and Choices: Exploring the Impact of Music Education* (OUP, 2012), *Music and Mind in Everyday Life* (Clarke, Dibben & Pitts; OUP, 2010), and a co-edited volume on audience experience, *Coughing and Clapping* (Burland & Pitts; Ashgate, 2014). She is director of the Sheffield Performer and Audience Research Centre ([sparc.dept.shef.ac.uk](http://sparc.dept.shef.ac.uk)) and currently leading the 30-month AHRC-funded project *Understanding Audiences for the Contemporary Arts*.

**Sarah Price** is Research Associate on the AHRC-funded *Understanding Audiences for the Contemporary Arts* study at the Department of Music, University of Sheffield. As both an academic and freelance audience researcher, Sarah has conducted audience research projects collaboratively with numerous arts organisations, including a Collaborative Doctoral Award with the City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra. Her research interests are in the value of arts engagement, understanding audience behaviour and patterns of attendance, and the role of academic research within the arts industry.

**Christina Scharff** is Reader in Gender, Media and Culture at King's College London. She is author and co-editor of several books, including *Gender, Subjectivity, and Cultural Work: The Classical Music Profession* (Routledge, 2018). Dr Scharff's other publications on the classical music profession include (with Anna Bull) "McDonald's music versus serious music': how production and consumption practices help to reproduce class inequality in the classical music profession' (*Cultural Sociology*, 2017) and 'Inequalities in the classical music industry: The role of subjectivity in constructions of the 'ideal classical musician'' (*The Classical Music Industry*, ed. Dromey/Haferkorn, Routledge, 2018). Her most recent publication is the article 'From 'not me' to 'me too': exploring the trickle-down effects of neoliberal feminism', forthcoming in *Rassenga Italiana di Sociologia*.

**Christabel Stirling** is a Researcher in Ethnomusicology and Sound Studies and a Visiting Lecturer in Music at the University of Westminster. She completed her DPhil at the University of Oxford, looking at the role of affect and the body in the making of musical publics. Her research has been published in *Contemporary Music Review*, *Journal of Sonic Studies*, and a number of edited collections. She also DJs and co-runs club nights in London.

**Tony Stoller** is Visiting Professor in Media History at Bournemouth University. His groundbreaking study of classical music across the whole of the second half of the 20th century – *Classical Music on UK Radio 1945 to 1995* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2017) – has just been published in paperback. He is also the author of the definitive history of commercial radio in the UK – *Sounds of your Life: The History of Independent Radio in the UK* (John Libbey, 2010). He was Chief Executive of the Radio Authority, the regulator for all non-BBC radio, between 1995 and 2003, and then helped to set up the UK's communications super-regulator, Ofcom, which took over the Radio Authority's duties in 2003. He now chairs Orchestras Live, an Arts Council England national portfolio organisation charged with ensuring the availability of high-quality orchestral music in underserved parts of England and for communities who may currently feel themselves excluded.

**Jane Williams** is an arts manager and consultant. A trained musician, she has specialist knowledge of orchestral music and opera, including contemporary classical music, and has worked closely with many of today's leading composers. In addition to her freelance work for organisations including the British Council and Southbank Centre, she has held senior management positions with English National Opera, the London Sinfonietta, and publisher Music Sales. Her current projects include programming the Guildhall School of Music & Drama's instrumental Masters in Orchestral Artistry, working with the London Symphony Orchestra. Jane is also Visiting Lecturer in Arts Management at Middlesex University, a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts, a member of Spitalfields Music's programme advisory group, and a keen chamber musician.

### **Programme Committee:**

Chris Dromey (Middlesex University)  
Julia Haferkorn (Middlesex University)  
Paul Keene (Barbican Centre)  
Christina Scharff (King's College London)

Special thanks to Nic Skinner and Sharon Stack for their support.

